

Unfinished Business

How City Council Has Dealt With Ethics and What Still Needs To Be Done

Roadmap to Reform

A Continuing Series



ETHICS IN GOVERNMENT AND THE COMMITTEE OF SEVENTY

For more than a century, the Committee of Seventy has been fighting for clean government in Philadelphia. We feel particularly qualified to comment on ethics because we were the earliest and most strident defender of the City's campaign finance law and have been the most outspoken proponent of closing loopholes that breed abuse, corruption and distrust of local government.

The Committee of Seventy also has been the city's most dogged advocate for tight and enforceable ethics reforms. We have helped drive positive, permanent changes in the City Charter to diminish pay-to-play. We have denounced public officials who misuse their positions to favor the well-connected and who don't hold their employees accountable.

The Committee of Seventy aims to be the catalyst for true reform in Philadelphia. In this role, we issued an Ethics Agenda to the 2007 candidates for Mayor and City Council. One of the most important recommendations resulted in the creation by Mayor Michael Nutter of a Task Force on Ethics and Campaign Finance Reform.

Over a 14 month period, Seventy issued three "Roadmap to Reform" reports to the Task Force with in-depth recommendations, based on research of best practices, to preserve and strengthen Philadelphia's campaign finance law, and to enact tough ethical controls extending across city government. We are gratified that most of our suggested reforms made their way into the Task Force's final report in December 2009.

This "Roadmap to Reform" includes Seventy's latest ethics reform initiative: a 2011 Ethics Agenda to the candidates for Philadelphia City Council. With five of Council's current 17 members retiring, the City Council that will be sworn into office in January 2012 will be a very different body. There will be new opportunities for ethics reforms.

This 2011 Ethics Agenda gives the new Council a place to start.

The non-profit Committee of Seventy is aggressively non-partisan. We do not support or oppose candidates for political office. We do not accept government funds.

Seventy's work is overseen by a 70-member Board of Directors and a small Executive Committee. P. Edward Lovelidge, Managing Partner, PricewaterhouseCoopers (pwc), is Chairman of the Board. Zachary Stalberg is President and CEO. This "Roadmap to Reform" was prepared by Ellen Mattleman Kaplan, Seventy's Vice President and Policy Director, along with the members of Seventy's Ethics Reform Subcommittee.



TABLE OF CONTENTS

Introduction	Page 4
2011 Ethics Agenda for City Council Candidates	Page 6
Ethics Scorecard	Page 11
I. Where City Council Has Succeeded	Page 11
II. Where City Council Has Failed	Page 14
III. Where City Council Has Unfinished Business	Page 20
IV. Where City Council Cannot Be Rated	Page 22
Exhibit A: 2007 Ethics Agenda for City Council Candidates	Page 23
Exhibit B: Pledges to 2007 Ethics Agenda By Council Members Running For Reelection In 2011 and Expanded Comments	Page 29



INTRODUCTION

2011 CITY COUNCIL ETHICS AGENDA AND SCORECARD

The non-partisan Committee of Seventy is committed to providing Philadelphians with the most comprehensive information about the City Council candidates for the May 17, 2011 primary.

Along with the Mayor, Philadelphia City Council is critical to the political culture in Philadelphia – by passing laws to make City government more honest and accountable and by conducting themselves with integrity while in office.

With the exception of a federal conviction of a senior Council staffer for corruption, and multiple ethics problems in City-related agencies, the last several years in City Council – and in City Hall, generally – have been largely scandal-free. With many critical issues beyond those involving honest government dominating the 2011 municipal elections, some may question the need for this Ethics Agenda.

However, the Committee of Seventy fervently believes there is no such thing as “too much” ethics in government.

Bad behavior can happen despite the most airtight laws. But clear, tough and enforceable laws decrease the likelihood that rules will be easily circumvented or broken. The public’s confidence in proposed solutions to crime or taxes or education or anything else depends on whether the voters believe their leaders are trustworthy.

This “Roadmap to Reform” report contains:

- Our 2011 Ethics Agenda, which we are asking all City Council candidates to respond to.
- A scorecard on the progress of City Council as a whole on the ethics reforms in Seventy’s 2007 Ethics Agenda.
- The pledges to the 2007 Ethics Agenda by Council members running for reelection in 2011.

Our 2011 Ethics Agenda contains some, but not all, of the reforms contained in the 2007 Ethics Agenda. We are pleased that a number of reforms proposed in that agenda – which is included as Exhibit A in this “Roadmap to Reform” – have since been enacted. These include, most notably, Philadelphia’s first-ever law disclosing the names and expenses of City lobbyists and various provisions to strengthen the City’s campaign finance law.

There also is a lot of “unfinished business.”



The Committee of Seventy urges the 2011 Council candidates to let the voters know how they plan to tackle this “unfinished business.” All of the responses will be published on www.seventy.org and also disseminated widely to voters.

This “Roadmap to Reform” also reminds voters of the responses of City Council members who, as candidates, responded to the 2007 Ethics Agenda. These members include: **Bill Green (at-large), William Greenlee (at-large), Curtis Jones, Jr. (Fourth District), Brian O’Neill (Tenth District), Maria Quiñones Sánchez (Seventh District), and Frank Rizzo, Jr. (at-large)**. Even if they opposed our proposed reforms, we greatly appreciate that they took the time to respond. We look forward to their responses this year.

We were disappointed not to hear from six other Council members who are now seeking reelection when they were candidates in 2007: Jannie Blackwell (Third District), Blondell Reynolds Brown (at-large), Darrell Clarke (Fifth District), W. Wilson Goode, Jr. (at-large), James Kenney (at-large) and Marian Tasco (Ninth District). We urge them to let the voters know where they stand on ethics issues this time around by responding to the 2011 Ethics Agenda.

NOTE: We recognize that current Council members may disagree with the scorecard and the characterization of their progress on ethics reforms. We invite their responses and will be pleased to post them on our website. We also encourage all the Council candidates to share their own ideas that are not included in the 2011 Ethics Agenda. We will post these as well.



2011 ETHICS AGENDA PHILADELPHIA CITY COUNCIL

The Committee of Seventy is asking you and the other declared candidates for Philadelphia City Council to commit to the attached Ethics Agenda – which is directed towards continuing to improve the political culture in Philadelphia.

Seventy would be surprised if you agreed with all of its recommendations. We urge you to embrace the ones you favor, explain your reasoning behind any you oppose and offer additional ideas we haven't thought of.

In 2007, Seventy distributed an "Ethics Agenda" to the mayoral and City Council candidates. This "Ethics Agenda" spurred the creation of a Task Force on Ethics and Campaign Finance Reform, whose Final Report contained many of Seventy's proposed reforms. Some ethics reforms achieved by City Council include:

- Passing the city's first-ever lobbying registration and disclosure law.
- Improving certain provisions of the city's campaign finance ordinance.
- Working more cooperatively with the Philadelphia Board of Ethics.

At the same time, there is a significant amount of "unfinished business," most notably:

- Enacting permanent rules that apply across the government, including forbidding nepotism, tightening policies on accepting gifts and imposing greater restrictions on outside employment.
- Passing a comprehensive whistleblower law.
- Adopting additional campaign finance reforms.

The next Council has an opportunity to strengthen Philadelphia's legal and policy framework to reach the highest level of ethical standards.

As you embark upon your campaign, we ask that you state your position on 24 specific reform measures that are designed to make Council as an institution, its members, and City government overall more accountable, transparent and effective.

Again, we invite you to share your own ideas for improving ethics in Philadelphia government. Your responses, and those of your opponents, will be published on the Committee of Seventy's website (www.seventy.org).



Please state your agreement, or explain your disagreement, with the following reforms:

Recent rulings of the U.S. Supreme Court have raised concerns about the floodgates for unlimited campaign dollars flowing into Philadelphia. The first test of the 2007 city campaign finance ordinance was overwhelmingly successful and helped cripple “pay-to-play” here.

- 1. I will oppose any bill that seeks to dismantle or weaken the city’s campaign finance ordinance, including changing existing contribution limits.**
- 2. I will support legislation to require corporations or unions that spend their general funds to support or oppose Philadelphia candidates to disclose their identity and amount of spending to the Philadelphia Board of Ethics, and to require the Board to make this information publicly available online.**
- 3. I will support strengthening the city’s campaign finance ordinance to require 527 committees – groups that are only permitted to advocate either on behalf of or in opposition to political issues, and not for the election or defeat of a particular candidate – to register as political committees.**

Although improvements in the city’s finance ordinance were made to reflect lessons learned in the 2007 municipal elections, other proposed reforms – such as tying the receipt of campaign dollars to an election cycle rather than to a calendar year – remain unaddressed.

- 4. I will support holding a City Council hearing after the 2011 elections to consider additional reforms of the campaign finance ordinance with an eye towards making the city’s law a national model for diminishing pay-to-play.**

Although the city maintains an online database of political contributions, it is difficult to search and to understand.

- 5. I will support providing city funds to improve the city’s electronic campaign finance report database so that it can be easily searched and understood by the public and its data can be exportable into a spreadsheet or other analytic software formats.**
- 6. I will support making it easy for the public to learn about the contributions made by recipients of non-competitively bid contracts to elected city officials by linking eContract Philly (the listing of firms and companies seeking or receiving non-competitively bid contract awards) with the campaign finance report database.**



City Council holds public hearings on proposed spending by virtually every taxpayer-funded unit of city government, including the Mayor's office, City departments, commissions, boards and agencies, the independently elected row offices and the School District of Philadelphia. The only part of government for which the budget is not open for public comment is City Council.

- 7. I will support holding a public hearing on City Council's annual proposed budget, and the budgets of individual Council members.**
- 8. I will support making details of Council's proposed budget available online, in the same format and in the same detail as other city departments.**
- 9. I will support a public comment period at the end of every daily budget hearing session – rather than at the end of the budget hearings – so that citizens can ask questions about proposed spending by all tax-payer funded units of city government.**

Many city employees hold second jobs. However, since information on outside employment is not online for most employees, it is hard to determine any potential conflicts of interest with the employee's city job.

- 10 I will support requiring all elected and appointed city employees to register their outside jobs, and a detailed job description, with the Philadelphia Board of Ethics on an annual basis and to update that information during the year, as needed. This information should be publicly available online.**

Philadelphia's independently elected row offices operate with little oversight. The City Controller has accused the Sheriff's office of severe financial mismanagement. The office in charge of city elections – the City Commissioners – was tarnished when its Deputy Commissioner (the daughter of the Commissioners' Chair) was found by the Philadelphia Board of Ethics to have engaged in illegal work related to elections.

- 11. I will support asking the voters to approve a proposed amendment to the city Charter to eliminate two independently elected row offices – City Commissioners and Sheriff – and to transfer their necessary functions to other parts of government in order to ensure greater accountability.**

City-related authorities, some on which City Council members serve as Board members, operate by different ethical rules and practices than the rest of city government – or one another. Three examples include the Philadelphia Authority for Industrial Development, Philadelphia Redevelopment Authority and, until recently, the Philadelphia Housing Authority.

- 12. I will support implementing consistent ethical rules and practices to be binding on all city-related authorities.**



Public officials sometimes hire or appoint members of their immediate family to work directly for them or recommend members of their immediate family for other paid or appointed positions in city government.

13. I will support the enactment of permanent legislation that forbids any city official or employee from having a role in hiring or promoting or participating in other personnel decisions involving a member of their immediate family (spouse, domestic partner, parent, sibling or child) either by the city official or employee or by others in city government.

14. I will not personally hire or appoint a member of my immediate family or recommend the hiring or appointment of a member of my immediate family by any other person, department, board, commission, agency or authority of city government.

An amendment to the City Charter proposed in Council last year would have overturned 60 year old rules prohibiting most of the city's workforce from engaging in political activity. The rules are still intact, although they do not apply to City Council's staff.

15. I will oppose amending the City Charter to allow city workers to serve as ward leaders, committeepeople or from taking part in the management or affairs of a political party or in a political campaign.

16. I will support reversing the current exemption of City Council staff from existing city rules that ban city workers from serving as ward leaders, committeepeople or from taking an active part in the management or affairs of a political party or in a political campaign.

17. I will not personally hire a ward leader, committee person to serve on my staff or allow my staff members to take an active part in the management or affairs of a political party or in a political campaign, including my future campaigns.

Philadelphia has several laws that protect city employees from retaliation for making credible reports of abuses and waste in government – but they only apply in certain circumstances.

18. I will support passage of a comprehensive whistleblower law that provides sufficient protections for city employees who make good faith complaints about perceived wrongdoing in government.

The City Charter requirement that all City Council meetings be open and accessible to the public at all times has often been sidestepped, with important deliberations effectively happening behind closed doors or meetings scheduled at times when most members of the public are unable to attend.

19. I will support promoting greater public access to, and participation in, meetings and hearings convened by City Council and its committees – including holding more sessions during evening hours and in locations throughout the city.



Annual disclosure statements that City Council members are required to file with the state and city are open to the public – but the public has to go to the Records Department in City Hall to see the city forms.

20. I will support legislation that requires all annual city financial disclosure statements to be publicly available online.

21. I will support making additional information about City Council and its staff publicly available on Council's website, including names, positions, salaries, membership on boards and commissions inside or outside government, and positions held in any political party and/or political organization.

The independent Board of Ethics received a strong mandate from the citizens of Philadelphia to regulate the ethical conduct of city government.

22. I will support sufficient funding for the Board of Ethics to operate effectively, including, but not limited to, the resources necessary to carry out its oversight of the city's new lobbying law.

An executive order places strict limitations on the solicitation or acceptance of gifts, gratuities and favors by officials in the executive and administrative branches of government.

23. I will support strengthening the current rules on the acceptance of gifts by enacting permanent and clear guidelines applicable to the entire city workforce that would allow gifts up to an explicit dollar value, with limited exceptions.

An office of the Inspector General is currently part of the executive branch and has no authority to investigate wrongdoing by other elected officials.

24. I will support the creation within the City Charter of an independent Inspector General with authority to investigate corruption, fraud, waste or dishonest practices throughout city government, including City Council.

If you would like to supplement your responses to the questions above with any additional ideas or statements, please feel free to provide further comments.



ETHICS SCORECARD

PHILADELPHIA CITY COUNCIL

The following sections of this “Roadmap to Reform” – pages 11 to 22 – rate City Council’s progress on ethics reforms since the 2007 election.

As we said earlier, we recognize that current Council members may disagree with the “scores” and how its actions have been characterized by Seventy. We invite their responses and will be pleased to post them on our website.

I. WHERE CITY COUNCIL HAS SUCCEEDED

Philadelphia City Council has earned a score of **“PASS”** in the following areas proposed in the Committee of Seventy’s 2007 Ethics Agenda for one of these reasons:

- Council has enacted ethics and campaign finance reforms (passing several improvements to the city’s campaign finance ordinance and the city’s first lobbyist registration and disclosure law);
- Council has preserved critical elements of the city’s campaign finance ordinance (maintaining existing contribution limits);
- Council has improved its website communications (providing timely and complete meeting transcripts); or
- Council has complied with existing ethics rules (obeying the city’s political activity rules and demanding the same of their staffs).

Proposed Reforms in 2007 Ethics Agenda	Action Taken By Council
Maintaining campaign contribution limits: I will oppose any bill that seeks to remove or weaken the existing campaign contribution limits for the 2007 mayoral candidates – or the 2007 City Council candidates in the event such a bill is introduced. (Ethics Agenda Item #1)	<p>At the time Seventy’s 2007 Ethics Agenda was released, City Council was considering several proposed campaign finance ordinances that would have either eliminated or raised the contribution limits for the 2007 mayoral election. Those ordinances were withdrawn.</p> <p>There was no other effort in Council to dismantle or change the contribution limits in the City’s campaign finance ordinance either for the 2007 candidates or for candidates in any subsequent municipal elections.</p>



<p>Evaluating the campaign finance law after the 2007 elections: I will support a comprehensive review of the campaign finance system after the November election by calling upon the next mayor to convene an independent panel to examine all current laws on campaign contributions and spending and to consider national best practices in regulating campaign finance, including the possibility of public financing, and to make reform recommendations to the mayor, City Council and the Board of Ethics. (Ethics Agenda Item #2)</p>	<p>The credit for establishing a Task Force on Ethics and Campaign Finance Reform in 2008 belongs to Mayor Nutter. However, City Council deserves recognition for enacting several improvements to the campaign finance law over the last two years – largely spearheaded by Council members Marian Tasco and Bill Green. These reforms include:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Requiring elected officials to raise funds (subject to limits) for transition and inauguration activities through their single candidate committees.• Permitting candidates to create separate litigation fund accounts to raise funds (subject to limits) to pay legal defense costs related to their participation in their own elections and establishing reporting requirements.• Creating a sliding scale of penalties (consideration of aggravating and mitigating factors) for violations of the campaign finance and ethics laws; establishing a per diem penalty for late filings of campaign finance reports; eliminating the requirement of disqualification from elective or appointive office or from City employment for violating the City’s ethics rules.• Closing a loophole in the campaign finance law that prohibits political action committees from evading the contribution limits by contributing funds through other political action committees funded by the same organization. <p>Although the Committee of Seventy and the Task Force on Ethics and Campaign Finance Reform recommended additional reforms of the campaign finance law, Council should be commended for the improvements made to date.</p>
<p>Providing Meeting Transcripts: I will promote greater public access to, and participation in, meetings and hearings convened by City Council and its committees -- including holding more sessions during evening hours and in locations throughout the City and also providing timely and complete transcripts on City Council’s web site. (Ethics Agenda Item #10)</p>	<p>Timely and complete transcripts of meetings of City Council as a whole and its individual subcommittees are available on Council’s website and easy to find.</p> <p>However, City Council has failed to promote greater public access to, and participation in, its meetings and hearings, as will be discussed in the “Where City Council Has Failed” scorecard. (See Page 14.)</p>



<p>Complying with political activity rules: I will abide by all laws regulating political activities – both permissible and prohibited – that might benefit me or any other candidate for political office, and will demand the same of members of my personal staff and any other staff who report to me. (Ethics Agenda item #19)</p>	<p>The City’s political activity rules have been the subject of significant debate in the last year. In the spring of 2010, legislation was introduced (spearheaded by Council members Marian Tasco and Bill Green) to alter the rules in a manner similar to the current version of the federal Hatch Act (which divides employees into those who are “less restricted” and permitted to engage in certain political activities, and those who are “further restricted” and prohibited from engaging in certain political activities). After two hearings, the legislation was tabled. In March 2011, with significant input from the staffs of Council members Tasco and Green, the Philadelphia Board of Ethics adopted a regulation to relax the rules on private political expression for all City employees. Both the Committee of Seventy and the Task Force on Ethics and Campaign Finance Reform strongly supported this action.</p> <p>However, Seventy did not support the Board’s decision to retain a long-standing interpretation of the City’s ethics rules by the Law Department that permits City Council’s staff to serve as ward leaders, committeepeople or to take an active part in a political party or political campaign. (Note: Council’s staff cannot serve as campaign treasurers or raise campaign funds.) Seventy continues to believe that Council’s staff should be prohibited from these political activities, as are virtually all other non-elected City employees.</p>
<p>Enacting a lobbyist registration and disclosure law: I will seek the enactment of an ordinance requiring all lobbyists, and individuals acting as lobbyists, engaged in business with the City, City-related departments, agencies and commissions and quasi-City agencies and authorities, to register as lobbyists, identify their clients and make public their expenses. (Ethics Agenda Item #20)</p>	<p>In June 2010, in what is a major step forward for Philadelphia, City Council passed the City’s first-ever bill requiring individuals and firms that lobby City officials to register with the Board of Ethics, to disclose their expenditures and to identify the recipient of anything of value under certain circumstances. Council members Marian Tasco and Councilman Bill Green deserve primary recognition for leading this reform effort. Councilman Frank Rizzo also deserves credit for being the first in Council to introduce a lobbyist registration and disclosure bill in 2007, although his bill was never voted on.</p>



II. WHERE CITY COUNCIL HAS FAILED

Philadelphia City Council has earned a score of **“FAIL”** in the following areas proposed in the Committee of Seventy’s 2007 Ethics Agenda for one of these reasons:

- Council considered legislation at a hearing, but did not allow it to be voted upon (enacting or strengthening policies on nepotism, second jobs and gifts);
- Council is moving “backwards” in enacting reforms (promoting greater public engagement in its proceedings);
- Council has taken no affirmative steps to act despite several opportunities and overwhelming evidence of significant need (funding for the Ethics Board);
- Council rules are not transparent or understandable to the public (simplifying its rules, making its own documents, and the City’s documents, more accessible); or
- Council has not acted in an area where there is an urgency to do so (adopting a plan to address local redistricting).

Proposed Reforms in 2007 Ethics Agenda	Action Taken By Council
Banning nepotism: I will support the enactment of legislation that forbids nepotism in City Council and in other City departments, agencies and commissions. (Ethics Agenda Item #3)	<p>Philadelphia has no legislation that prohibits City employees from making personnel decisions (e.g., hiring, supervising, promoting) involving close relatives, or from recommending close relatives for other city jobs. In its December 2009 report, the Task Force on Ethics and Campaign Finance Reform recommended the enactment of a strict anti-nepotism policy extending across all City government – a position that is shared by the Committee of Seventy.</p> <p>City Council has not responded to the recommendations of either the Task Force or Seventy. An anti-nepotism bill introduced by Councilman Frank Rizzo was considered at a May 2010 hearing of the entire Council, but never brought up for a vote.</p> <p>On January 25, 2011, Mayor Nutter signed an Executive Order prohibiting City officials and employees in the administrative and executive branches from having a role in hiring or employment decisions that could benefit or disadvantage a family member or life partner. Covered relationships must be reported to the covered employee’s appointing authority and to the Director of</p> <p>- continued -</p>



	Human Resources. Reassignments are required where necessary to eliminate the prohibited employment relationship between related supervisors and employees. The Executive Order does not cover City Council or its employees.
Regulating second jobs held by elected officials: I will support the enactment of legislation that prohibits members of City Council and other elected officials from holding positions with, or owning any interest in, a company or firm that does, or might seek to do, business with the City. The prohibition should not apply to teaching at educational institutions. (Ethics Agenda Item #6)	<p>All City employees, including Council members and other elected officials, are permitted to hold second jobs. However, they may not do their second jobs during their City work hours or use any City resources. Employees with outside jobs may be subject to disclosure and recusal requirements under the Philadelphia Code.</p> <p>In its December 2009 report, the Task Force on Ethics and Campaign Finance Reform recommended that City employees register their outside employment annually with the Philadelphia Board of Ethics – and that the Board make this information readily available to the public on the City’s website. The Committee of Seventy has proposed going further by banning elected officials from having any ties (employment or financial) with companies or firms with, or seeking, City business.</p> <p>City Council has not responded to the recommendations of either the Task Force or Seventy, or debated whether the City’s rules on second jobs are sufficient to avoid potential conflicts of interest. A bill introduced by Councilman Frank Rizzo to strengthen rules governing City employees who hold second jobs was considered at a May 2010 hearing of the entire Council, but never brought up for a vote.</p> <p>On January 25, 2011, Mayor Nutter signed an Executive Order prohibiting City employees in the administrative and executive branches from using City resources or time for outside employment and self-employment. Covered employees are required to report their second jobs to their appointing authority and obtain prior written approval. Second jobs must also be reported to the Department of Human Resources, which will provide the Mayor with an annual list of covered employees with approved outside employment and self-employment. The Executive Order does not cover City Council or its employees.</p>
Promoting greater public engagement in Council’s proceedings: I will promote greater public access to, and participation in, meetings and <i>- continued -</i>	<p>Although City Council provides timely and complete transcripts on its website, it has not done well in promoting greater public access to, and participation in, its meetings.</p> <p>In 2009, City Council announced plans to increase public <i>- continued -</i></p>



<p>hearings convened by City Council and its committees -- including holding more sessions during evening hours and in locations throughout the City and also providing timely and complete transcripts on City Council's web site. (Ethics Agenda Item #10)</p>	<p>access to budget hearings by (1) televising hearings live (and rebroadcasting them) on Comcast Channel 64, the municipal government's access station, (2) streaming video and audio versions of the budget hearings live through the City's website, and (3) holding some budget hearings in locations outside City Hall. Although (1) and (2) are continuing, no budget hearings outside of City Hall are scheduled this year. Committee meetings are always held at City Hall, typically in the middle of the day when it is not convenient for working people to attend.</p> <p>A Pennsylvania Supreme Court ruling forced Council to enact rules in November 2010 to permit any Philadelphia resident or taxpayer to speak for three minutes before any Council vote on bills and resolutions on its agenda for that day. However, by April 2011, the Council approved a subsequent rule to cut back on public input.</p>
<p>Simplifying Council's Rules: I will support reforms that make the business of City Council, including rules, more understandable to the average citizen. (Ethics Agenda Item #11)</p>	<p>Although the rules of Council are posted on its website (albeit not prominently), they are difficult for the average citizen to read or understand. Some common practices -- such as councilmanic prerogative or holding public hearings on certain bills, but not on others -- are not in writing. Council's contracting and hiring processes remain a mystery.</p>
<p>Ensuring sufficient funding for the Ethics Board: I will work with my colleagues on City Council to ensure ample funding to support the operations of the Board of Ethics including, but not limited to, the appointment of an independent General Counsel who is unaffiliated with the mayor or City Council. (Ethics Agenda Item #16)</p>	<p>The 2006 voter-approved amendment to the Philadelphia Home Rule Charter that created the Board of Ethics specifically earmarked \$1 million for its first two fiscal years after the Charter amendment became effective. In fiscal year 2009-2010, and again in fiscal year 2010-2011, the Board's budget was reduced in two steps to \$810,000 as part of the citywide departmental cuts. At the Board's budget hearing in April 2009, Board member William Brown III testified that the lack of adequate funding has "halted the Board's growth and made it challenging to fulfill its mandates." In a July 2010 Audit of the Ethics Board, the City Controller also concluded that a "lack of sufficient funding could imperil the Board's mission, particularly in the area of enforcement."</p> <p>Given the citywide budget cuts, it is difficult to say whether the Board of Ethics has suffered disproportionately. However, it is clear that its workload has grown substantially. For example, in</p> <p>- <i>continued</i> -</p>



	<p>June 2010, City Council passed the City’s first-ever lobbyist registration and disclosure law. Since that time, and without any additional funding, the Board of Ethics has been preparing for its new responsibilities to administer and enforce the lobbyist law when it goes into effect on July 1, 2011.</p> <p>Although there are some spending increases in Mayor Nutter’s proposed budget for fiscal year 2011-2012, none are earmarked for the Ethics Board. The Mayor’s budget proposal continues to hold the Board’s annual budget at \$810,000. In response, the Ethics Board is seeking an additional \$130,000.</p> <p>With respect to the appointment of a General Counsel – which is the second part of Ethics Agenda Item #16 – that position is filled by the Ethics Board, rather than by City Council and is unaffiliated with the Mayor or City Council.</p>
<p>Strengthening gifts acceptance policies: I will seek the enactment of permanent legislation that bans the acceptance of gifts, gratuities and favors above a nominal amount by members of City Council and their staffs. (Ethics Agenda Item #17)</p>	<p>City Council and its staff are prohibited under the Philadelphia Home Rule Charter from soliciting or accepting a “gratuity in the form of money or otherwise for any act or omission” in the course of their public work. Under the Philadelphia Code, no City employee “shall solicit, accept or receive any gifts, loan, gratuity, favor or service of substantial economic value” that might reasonably be expected to influence them in their jobs.</p> <p>In its December 2009 report, the Task Force on Ethics and Campaign Finance Reform recommended the adoption within the Philadelphia Code of a single gifts acceptance policy applicable across the board to all City employees, elected and non-elected. The Task Force also recommended prohibiting gifts above a stated dollar value and requiring employees to file written reports of all gifts to their supervisors. The Committee of Seventy also has recommended a stricter gifts acceptance policy for all City employees, with explicit dollar limits.</p> <p>City Council has not responded to the recommendations of either the Task Force or Seventy. A bill introduced by Councilman Frank Rizzo to strengthen the Philadelphia Code’s gifts provisions was considered at a May 2010 hearing of the entire Council, but never brought up for a vote.</p> <p>On January 25, 2011, Mayor Nutter signed an Executive Order - <i>continued</i> -</p>



	<p>prohibiting City employees in the administrative and executive branches of government from receiving invitations, food, and drink and subjecting them to increased reporting requirements if they are offered gifts. Members of Boards and Commissions who are not City employees are barred from accepting gifts from persons who have or would be reasonably expected to have business before them. The Executive Order makes explicit the requirements that must be met if a gift is to be considered a "gift to the city," rather than a prohibited gift to an individual, and also provides for sanctions against those who offer gifts to covered employees, up to and including debarment from City contracts. The Mayor's Executive Order, which strengthened an earlier Executive Order on the acceptance of gifts by employees under his control, does not cover City Council or its employees.</p>
<p>Convening a Citizen's Commission to address local redistricting: I will call upon the next mayor to convene a non-partisan and independent citizen's commission to allow for an open and public process that will result in a fair redistricting plan, thereby reducing the conflicts of interest inherent when political district lines are drawn exclusively by the mayor and City Council. The commission will report to the mayor and to City Council. (Ethics Agenda Item #21)</p>	<p>Under the Philadelphia Home Rule Charter, City Council is required to redraw the boundaries of Council's districts no later than six months after the release of the Census, which happens every ten years, or they lose their paychecks. This year, the Census data on Philadelphia's population shifts was released on March 9, 2011 – giving City Council until September 9, 2011 to come up with a plan for redrawing Council's 10 districts.</p> <p>In March 2011, the Committee of Seventy proposed a 15-step plan for Citywide redistricting that guarantees more transparency and fairness to City voters than has existed in the past. See http://www.seventy.org/Downloads/Recommendaions to Improve transparency and public participation in 2011 Local redistricting.pdf. As of April 29, 2011, City Council had not responded to this plan or publicly addressed how it will handle local redistricting.</p>
<p>Making City and Council documents transparent: I will seek the adoption of, and support compliance with, new rules making all City and City Council documents public, consistent with the best practices in the nation, - <i>continued</i> -</p>	<p>Despite a request by the Committee of Seventy in each of the last three years, Council does not hold a public hearing on its own budget or release detailed spending information regarding Council as a whole, or individual Council members. The City's required financial disclosure forms are not available online. The campaign finance database is still hard-to-access, hard-to-navigate, and hard-to-read.</p>



unless there is a compelling reason to restrict access to those documents. (Ethics Agenda Item #22)	
---	--



III. WHERE CITY COUNCIL HAS UNFINISHED BUSINESS

Philadelphia City Council has earned a score of “**INCOMPLETE**” in the following areas proposed in the Committee of Seventy’s 2007 Ethics Agenda for one of these reasons:

- Council has never addressed the issue (reforming councilmanic prerogative, regulating public officials seeking future jobs, changing the rules for calling special elections); or
- Council’s actions have improved, but not significantly enough to warrant a score of “pass.”

Proposed Reforms in 2007 Ethics Agenda	Action Taken By Council
Reforming councilmanic prerogative: I will support the adoption of a set of ground rules to balance the absolute control of Council members over development and other projects in their home districts with the best interests of the City as a whole. (Ethics Agenda Item #5)	<p>There is an unwritten rule in City Council – known as councilmanic prerogative – that gives its ten district members a veto power over legislation affecting their districts. Council members can use this power to stall or to reject everything from multi-million dollar development projects to small retail establishments. While district Council members defend this practice as acting on behalf of their constituents, critics say councilmanic prerogative can be misused to ignore the best interests of the City as a whole.</p> <p>City Council has not addressed any reform of councilmanic prerogative.</p>
Regulating public officials seeking future outside employment: I will support legislation that places reasonable and well-articulated regulations on public officials who seek future outside employment while still on the City’s payroll. (Ethics Agenda Item #7)	<p>The Philadelphia Code imposes certain requirements (e.g., financial disclosure, recusal) on City employees who are in a position to make decisions or take actions concerning firms with which they are discussing future employment.</p> <p>City Council has not addressed whether these rules sufficiently prevent potential conflicts of interest presented when public officials are seeking future employment with a firm or company with, or seeking, City business.</p>
Calling Special Elections: I will support amending the Philadelphia Home Rule Charter to provide clear and and non-discretionary rules for scheduling a special election to fill a vacancy on City Council. (Ethics Agenda Item #8)	<p>The timing of a special election to fill a vacancy on City Council is left to the discretion of the President of Council. This leaves open the possibility of one or more vacancies remaining unfilled for long periods of time, thereby undermining the effectiveness of the legislative process and leaving constituents unrepresented.</p> <p>City Council has not addressed rules governing special elections to fill a Council vacancy. No special elections have been held in the period following the release of Seventy’s 2007 Ethics Agenda.</p>



<p>Improving Council's Culture: I will nurture a culture that treats all individuals coming before Council with dignity and respect and that demands civility among all members of Council and their staffs. (Ethics Agenda Item #9)</p>	<p>Although it is unknown what happens behind closed doors, public displays of hostility among members and their staffs are rare. At hearings attended by the Committee of Seventy, outside visitors who speak before Council have generally been treated respectfully by members who address them.</p> <p>However, Seventy believes that City Council can, and should, hold itself to a higher standard of behavior towards the public by not arriving late, walking in and out of the room or using their cell phones during hearings and meetings. While this conduct may be unavoidable at times, it is distracting to speakers and creates the perception that Council members are not paying attention to the proceedings.</p>
---	--



IV. WHERE CITY COUNCIL CANNOT BE RATED

Several items in the 2007 Ethics Agenda are not able to be readily monitored or evaluated. For this reason, they are not included in the 2011 Ethics Agenda and, in hindsight, probably should not have been in the 2007 Ethics Agenda.

Although the Committee of Seventy is not giving these items a formal rating, they are nonetheless important and are listed below:

- **Personally Hiring or Recommending Close Relatives for City Jobs:** I will not personally hire or appoint a member of my immediate family (spouse, domestic partner, parent, sibling or child), or recommend the hiring or appointment of a member of my immediate family by any other person, department, board, commission, agency or authority of City government. (Ethics Agenda Item #4)
- **Publishing names of donors:** I will frequently publish the names of all donors to my campaign account, political committees and non-governmental organizations I control, above and beyond what is required by state law. (Ethics Agenda Item #12)
- **Hiring and promoting based on character and qualifications, rather than political support:** I will only hire, promote, appoint and confirm individuals who meet the highest standards for ethics, integrity and character, as well as published, objective qualifications to perform the jobs to which they are assigned, without regard to past or future political support. (Ethics Agenda Item #13)
- **Taking personal responsibility for hiring and managing staff:** I will assume personal responsibility for interviewing and hiring all individuals who work directly or indirectly for me, and will further require that all such individuals report either to me or to others on my staff as designated by me. (Ethics Agenda Item #14)
- **Cooperating with the Board of Ethics:** I will require all employees who work for me, and all appointees for whom I am responsible, paid and unpaid, to abide by all Board of Ethics advisory opinions, rules and enforcement decisions and will cooperate fully with the Board in carrying out its investigative responsibilities and implementing its rules and decisions. (Ethics Agenda Item #15)
- **Limiting the use of complimentary tickets:** I will seek reasonable limitations on the number of complimentary tickets given to public officials for use at any City-owned or City-managed facility, which includes a prohibition on using those tickets for any past, current or future political fundraising purposes. (Ethics Agenda Item #18)



EXHIBIT A – 2007 ETHICS AGENDA



The Committee of Seventy's ETHICS AGENDA PHILADELPHIA CITY COUNCIL

The Committee of Seventy is asking you and the other declared candidates for Philadelphia City Council to commit to the attached Ethics Agenda – which is directed towards changing the political culture in Philadelphia. Each of the five declared Democratic mayoral candidates have already endorsed proposals in a similar Ethics Agenda. A copy has just been sent to the new Republican candidate.

The overwhelming voter support for two recent ethics reform ballot questions has sent an unmistakable message that Philadelphians want to change the political culture. More work remains to be done.

As you embark upon your campaign, we ask that you state your position on 22 specific reform measures. We also hope that you will propose additional ideas for making government more accountable and City Council more effective. Your responses will be published on the websites of The Next Mayor project (www.thenextmayor.com) and the Committee of Seventy (www.seventy.org).

Please state your agreement, or explain your disagreement, with the following reforms:

With the municipal elections well underway, bills have been introduced in Philadelphia City Council that would effectively dismantle the city's campaign finance system for the mayoral candidates. There is growing concern that passage of these bills will resuscitate pay-to-play in Philadelphia.

- 1. I will oppose any bill that seeks to remove or weaken the existing campaign contribution limits for the 2007 mayoral candidates -- or for the 2007 City Council candidates in the event such a bill is introduced.**
- 2. I will support a comprehensive review of the campaign finance system after the November election by calling upon the next mayor to convene an independent panel to examine all current laws on campaign contributions and spending and to consider national best practices in regulating campaign finance, including the possibility of public financing, and to make reform recommendations to the mayor, City Council and the Board of Ethics.**



Public officials sometimes hire or appoint members of their immediate family to work directly for them or recommend members of their immediate family for other paid or appointed positions in city government.

- 3. I will support the enactment of legislation that forbids nepotism in City Council and in other City departments, agencies and commissions.**
- 4. I will not personally hire or appoint a member of my immediate family (spouse, domestic partner, parent, sibling or child), or recommend the hiring or appointment of a member of my immediate family by any other person, department, board, commission, agency or authority of City government.**

The city's ten council districts are sometimes described as individual fiefdoms, in part because of district council members' de facto veto power over development and other projects in their home districts.

- 5. I will support the adoption of a set of ground rules to balance the absolute control of Council members over development and other projects in their home districts with the best interests of the City as a whole.**

City Council members are permitted to hold second jobs, without regard to whether their private employers either do business with the city or hope to obtain city business.

- 6. I will support the enactment of legislation that prohibits members of City Council and other elected officials from holding positions with, or owning any interest in, a company or firm that does, or might seek to do, business with the city. The prohibition should not apply to teaching at educational institutions.**

There is no ethics law that deals with a public official negotiating for future employment with a private company that does business with the City, according to the Board of Ethics.

- 7. I will support legislation that places reasonable and well-articulated regulations on public officials who seek future outside employment while still on the City's payroll.**

The timing of a special election to fill a vacancy on City Council is left to the discretion of the President of City Council. This leaves open the possibility of one or more vacancies remaining unfilled for long periods of time, thereby undermining the effectiveness of the legislative process and leaving constituents unrepresented.



- 8. I will support amending the Philadelphia Home Rule Charter to provide clear and and non-discretionary rules for scheduling a special election to fill a vacancy on City Council.**

Many people complain that Council meetings are inhospitable to citizens, characterized by members talking on cell phones, walking in and out of the room and, on occasion, marked by displays of unruly behavior and open hostility among members.

- 9. I will nurture a culture that treats all individuals coming before Council with dignity and respect and that demands civility among all members of Council and their staffs.**

The City Charter requirement that all City Council meetings be open and accessible to the public at all times has often been sidestepped, with important changes effectively happening behind closed doors or meetings scheduled at times when most members of the public are unable to attend.

- 10. I will promote greater public access to, and participation in, meetings and hearings convened by City Council and its committees -- including holding more sessions during evening hours and in locations throughout the City and also providing timely and complete transcripts on City Council's web site.**

- 11. I will support reforms that make the business of City Council, including rules, more understandable to the average citizen.**

Frequently, political friends and financial supporters are appointed to, or hired or confirmed for, positions in offices, departments, boards, commissions, agencies and authorities in city government -- creating doubts about their qualifications and their independence.

- 12. I will frequently publish the names of all donors to my campaign account, political committees and non-governmental organizations I control, above and beyond what is required by state law.**

- 13. I will only hire, promote, appoint and confirm individuals who meet the highest standards for ethics, integrity and character, as well as published, objective qualifications to perform the jobs to which they are assigned, without regard to past or future political support.**

- 14. I will assume personal responsibility for interviewing and hiring all individuals who work directly or indirectly for me, and will further require that all such individuals report either to me or to others on my staff as designated by me.**



The new independent Board of Ethics received a strong mandate from the citizens of Philadelphia to regulate the ethical conduct of city government.

15. I will require all employees who work for me, and all appointees for whom I am responsible, paid and unpaid, to abide by all Board of Ethics advisory opinions, rules and enforcement decisions and will cooperate fully with the Board in carrying out its investigative responsibilities and implementing its rules and decisions.

16. I will work with my colleagues on City Council to ensure ample funding to support the operations of the Board of Ethics including, but not limited to, the appointment of an independent General Counsel who is unaffiliated with the mayor or City Council.

An executive order places strict limitations on the solicitation or acceptance of gifts, gratuities and favors by officials in the executive and administrative branches of government.

17. I will seek the enactment of permanent legislation that bans the acceptance of gifts, gratuities and favors above a nominal amount by members of City Council and their staffs.

Some cities have dropped some of the perks that go along with public office, such as giving public officials complimentary tickets to events in City-owned or City-managed facilities, particularly when budget cuts threaten other city services.

18. I will seek reasonable limitations on the number of complimentary tickets given to public officials for use at any City-owned or City-managed facility, which includes a prohibition on using those tickets for any past, current or future political fundraising purposes.

The City Charter forbids City Council members from engaging in political activity that takes place during scheduled hours of City employment. The lines between doing Council work and campaign work are often blurred.

19. I will abide by all laws regulating political activities – both permissible and prohibited – that might benefit me or any other candidate for political office, and will demand the same of members of my personal staff and any other staff who report to me.



Lobbyists or lawyers acting as lobbyists are often perceived as having improper or undue influence on decisions made by the Office of the Mayor, City Council and other City departments, agencies and commissions.

- 20. I will seek the enactment of an ordinance requiring all lobbyists, and individuals acting as lobbyists, engaged in business with the City, City-related departments, agencies and commissions and quasi-City agencies and authorities, to register as lobbyists, identify their clients and make public their expenses.**

A recent study found that Philadelphia has two City Council districts whose political lines are among the most unevenly drawn in the nation. Redistricting will occur during the next mayor's term in office.

- 21. I will call upon the next mayor to convene a non-partisan and independent citizen's commission to allow for an open and public process that will result in a fair redistricting plan, thereby reducing the conflicts of interest inherent when political district lines are drawn exclusively by the mayor and City Council. The commission will report to the mayor and to City Council.**

Pennsylvania has a poor reputation when it comes to disclosure of public documents.

- 22. I will seek the adoption of, and support compliance with, new rules making all City and City Council documents public, consistent with the best practices in the nation, unless there is a compelling reason to restrict access to those documents.**



**EXHIBIT B – PLEDGES TO 2007 ETHICS AGENDA BY COUNCIL MEMBERS RUNNING FOR
REELECTION IN 2001 AND EXPANDED COMMENTS**



Reforms in 2007 Ethics Agenda	Council Scorecard	Pledges to 2007 Ethics Agenda by Council members running for reelection in 2011											
		Jannie Blackwell 3 rd District	Darrell Clarke 5 th District	Bill Green At-large	William Greenlee At-large	Wilson Goode Jr. At-large	Curtis Jones Jr. 4 th District	James Kenney At-large	Brian O'Neill 10 th District	Maria Quiñones Sánchez 7 th District	Blondell Reynolds Brown At-large	Frank Rizzo Jr. At-large	Marian Tasco 9 th District
1. Maintain existing campaign contribution limits	Pass	No Response	No Response	Support	Support	No Response	Support	No Response	Support	Support	No Response	Support	No Response
2. Convene independent panel to review campaign finance law and recommend reforms	Pass	No Response	No Response	Support	Support	No Response	Support	No Response	Support	Support	No Response	Support	No Response
3. Support bill limiting City employees from hiring or recommending family members for City jobs (also known as anti-nepotism)	Fail	No Response	No Response	Support	Support	No Response	Did Not Support	No Response	Support	Support	No Response	Support	No Response
4. Agree not to <u>personally</u> hire or recommend family members for City jobs	Not Rated	No Response	No Response	Support	Support	No Response	Support	No Response	Support	Support	No Response	Support	No Response
5. Adopt rules to balance the absolute control of Council members over development projects in their districts with the best Interests of the City as a whole (also known as councilmanic prerogative)	Incomplete	No Response	No Response	Support	Support	No Response	Support	No Response	Did Not Support	Support	No Response	Support	No Response
6. Prohibit Council members and elected officials from holding positions, or owning	Fail	No Response	No Response	Did Not Support	Support	No Response	Support	No Response	Did Not Support	Support	No Response	Support	No Response



Reforms in 2007 Ethics Agenda	Council Scorecard	Pledges to 2007 Ethics Agenda by Council members running for reelection in 2011											
		Jannie Blackwell 3 rd District	Darrell Clarke 5 th District	Bill Green At-large	William Greenlee At-large	Wilson Goode Jr. At-large	Curtis Jones Jr. 4 th District	James Kenney At-large	Brian O'Neill 10 th District	Maria Quiñones Sánchez 7 th District	Blondell Reynolds Brown At-large	Frank Rizzo Jr. At-large	Marian Tasco 9 th District
an interest, in companies or firms that do or seek City business													
7. Regulate search for future jobs by City employees with a business or firm that does City business	Incomplete	No Response	No Response	Support	Support	No Response	Support	No Response	Support	Support	No Response	Support	No Response
8. Establish clear and non-discretionary rules for scheduling special elections to fill Council vacancies	Incomplete	No Response	No Response	Support	Support	No Response	Support	No Response	Support	Support	No Response	Support	No Response
9. Promote a more civil and respectful culture for visitors and among Council members and their staffs	Incomplete	No Response	No Response	Support	Support	No Response	Support	No Response	Support	Support	No Response	Support	No Response
10. Promote greater public access to Council meetings and hearings	Fail	No Response	No Response	Support	Support	No Response	Support	No Response	Support	Support	No Response	Support	No Response
11. Publish timely transcripts on Council's website	Pass	No Response	No Response	Support	Support	No Response	Support	No Response	Support	Support	No Response	Support	No Response
12. Make Council's business, including rules, more understandable to the average citizen	Fail	No Response	No Response	Support	Support	No Response	Support	No Response	Support	Support	No Response	Support	No Response



Reforms in 2007 Ethics Agenda	Council Scorecard	Pledges to 2007 Ethics Agenda by Council members running for reelection in 2011											
		Jannie Blackwell 3 rd District	Darrell Clarke 5 th District	Bill Green At-large	William Greenlee At-large	Wilson Goode Jr. At-large	Curtis Jones Jr. 4 th District	James Kenney At-large	Brian O'Neill 10 th District	Maria Quiñones Sánchez 7 th District	Blondell Reynolds Brown At-large	Frank Rizzo Jr. At-large	Marian Tasco 9 th District
13. Agree to more frequent publication of donors beyond what is required by law	Not Rated	No Response	No Response	Support	Support	No Response	Did Not Support	No Response	Did Not Support	Support	No Response	Support	No Response
14. Agree to hire individuals of the highest ethics, character and credentials -- without regard to political support	Not Rated	No Response	No Response	Support	Support	No Response	Support	No Response	Support	Support	No Response	Support	No Response
15. Assume personal responsibility for staff, including direct reporting by staff member	Not Rated	No Response	No Response	Support	Support	No Response	Support	No Response	Support	Support	No Response	Support	No Response
16. Cooperate with the Board of Ethics and require all employees and appointees to do so as well	Not Rated	No Response	No Response	Support	Support	No Response	Support	No Response	Support	Support	No Response	Support	No Response
17. Ensure ample funding for Board of Ethics	Fail	No Response	No Response	Support	Support	No Response	No Response	No Response	Support	Support	No Response	Support	No Response
18. Appoint an independent General Counsel separate from the Mayor or Council ⁱ	Not Rated	No Response	No Response	Support	Support	No Response	No Response	No Response	Support	Support	No Response	Support	No Response
19. Enact legislation to ban the acceptance of gifts	Fail	No Response	No Response	Support	Support	No Response	Support	No Response	Support	Support	No Response	Support – see footnote	No Response



Reforms in 2007 Ethics Agenda	Council Scorecard	Pledges to 2007 Ethics Agenda by Council members running for reelection in 2011											
		Jannie Blackwell 3 rd District	Darrell Clarke 5 th District	Bill Green At-large	William Greenlee At-large	Wilson Goode Jr. At-large	Curtis Jones Jr. 4 th District	James Kenney At-large	Brian O'Neill 10 th District	Maria Quiñones Sánchez 7 th District	Blondell Reynolds Brown At-large	Frank Rizzo Jr. At-large	Marian Tasco 9 th District
above a nominal amount												xi	
20. Limit complimentary tickets to events in City owned or managed facilities, and prohibit use of tickets for fundraising	Not Rated	No Response	No Response	Support	Support	No Response	Support	No Response	Support	Support	No Response	Support	No Response
21. Comply with laws regulating political activities	Pass	No Response	No Response	Support	Support	No Response	Support	No Response	Support	Support	No Response	Support	No Response
22. Support lobbyist registration and disclosure legislation	Pass	No Response	No Response	Support	Support	No Response	Support	No Response	Support	Support	No Response	Support	No Response
23. Convene non-partisan commission to recommend fair redistricting plan	Fail	No Response	No Response	Support	Support	No Response	Support	No Response	Did Not Support	Support	No Response	Support	No Response
24. Support full transparency of all City and Council documents	Fail	No Response	No Response	Support	Support	No Response	Support	No Response	Support	Support	No Response	Support	No Response



The Committee of Seventy's 2007 ETHICS AGENDA PHILADELPHIA CITY COUNCIL

Expanded Comments from City Council District and At-Large Candidates

With the municipal elections well underway, bills have been introduced in Philadelphia City Council that would effectively dismantle the city's campaign finance system for the mayoral candidates. There is growing concern that passage of these bills will resuscitate pay-to-play in Philadelphia.

1. I will oppose any bill that seeks to remove or weaken the existing campaign contribution limits for the 2007 mayoral candidates -- or for the 2007 City Council candidates in the event such a bill is introduced.

District 4	Curtis Jones, Jr. (D)	Yes, I was one of the City Council candidates leading the fight against the recent Kenney bill designed to lift caps on campaign contributions. I wrote a letter to my Councilwoman and took part in the press conference objecting to what I considered a regressive idea.
At- large	William Greenlee (D)	To weaken our existing campaign finance laws at this time is a step in the wrong direction.

2. I will support a comprehensive review of the campaign finance system after the November election by calling upon the next mayor to convene an independent panel to examine all current laws on campaign contributions and spending and to consider national best practices in regulating campaign finance, including the possibility of public financing, and to make reform recommendations to the mayor, City Council and the Board of Ethics.

District 4	Curtis Jones, Jr. (D)	I will support public financing in order to ensure a level playing field for candidates with means and those without. In a system that often revolves around the contributions of a few wealthy interests, candidates have a disincentive to seek support from a broad spectrum of communities and individuals, including the poor, underprivileged, and underserved.
---------------	-----------------------	---



District 7	Maria Quiñones Sánchez (D)	I will support a comprehensive review of the campaign finance system. I will sponsor or co-sponsor legislation for public financing of city campaigns.
At-large	William Greenlee (D)	Clean elections and public financing are working in a number of states and municipalities. The Maine model for Clean Elections is certainly worthy of evaluating.

Public officials sometimes hire or appoint members of their immediate family to work directly for them or recommend members of their immediate family for other paid or appointed positions in city government.

3. I will support the enactment of legislation that forbids nepotism in City Council and in other City departments, agencies and commissions.

District 4	Curtis Jones, Jr. (D)	While it is true that the hiring of unqualified personnel is a problem, I do not support this legislation because it forbids some highly qualified individuals who come from families involved in public service. I do not think being a relative of a public servant should qualify or disqualify a potential city worker. I would support an effort to involve and empower the Board of Ethics in deciding whether or not an individual was hired appropriately.
At-large	William Greenlee (D)	Philadelphia should be a meritocracy. The citizens of Philadelphia deserve a city government that values ability above political patronage.

4. I will not personally hire or appoint a member of my immediate family (spouse, domestic partner, parent, sibling or child), or recommend the hiring or appointment of a member of my immediate family by any other person, department, board, commission, agency or authority of City government.



District 4	Curtis Jones, Jr. (D)	I agree. I will not recommend or hire members of my immediate family. However, being a relative should not automatically disqualify an applicant who is otherwise qualified to fill a position in city government.
------------	-----------------------	--

The city's ten council districts are sometimes described as individual fiefdoms, in part because of district council members' de facto veto power over development and other projects in their home districts.

5. I will support the adoption of a set of ground rules to balance the absolute control of Council members over development and other projects in their home districts with the best interests of the City as a whole.

District 4	Curtis Jones, Jr. (D)	I agree. The welfare of the city as a whole and what is in my district is my concern as a council person. While it is important to represent the interests of the constituents of my district, I do not think it is appropriate to do so to the detriment of the city as a whole. Members of City Council should advocate for creative community coalitions and create opportunities regardless of their political self interest.
District 7	Maria Quiñones Sánchez (D)	I will support the adoption of a set of ground rules to balance the absolute control of Council members over development and projects in their home districts with the best interest of the city as a whole. I will also urge the reforming of the Zoning code and work with the planning commission to ensure that we develop neighborhood plans throughout the 7th district so that residents can work to develop projects as opposed to wasting time opposing projects.
At-large	William Greenlee (D)	The city's ten council districts are sometimes described as individual fiefdoms, in part because of district council members' de facto veto power over development and other projects in their home districts. In general, the City's Zoning Code needs to be rewritten consistent with a master plan for the City. We have far too many zoning districts and the process is too complicated. Chicago has an online permitting process we should look at. Consistency and efficiency in the process are necessary to spur economic development and investment. However, the new



		zoning laws and master plan should pursue contextual zoning that maintains quality of life in our neighborhoods. These goals are undermined when our City's ten District Council Members exercise de facto veto power over development in their home districts.
--	--	---

City Council members are permitted to hold second jobs, without regard to whether their private employers either do business with the city or hope to obtain city business.

6. I will support the enactment of legislation that prohibits members of City Council and other elected officials from holding positions with, or owning any interest in, a company or firm that does, or might seek to do, business with the city. The prohibition should not apply to teaching at educational institutions.

District 4	Curtis Jones, Jr. (D)	I agree that elected officials in order to avoid conflicts of interest—real. Or perceived--should avoid having personal financial interest in the city's business.
District 10	Brian O'Neill (R)	I support the enactment of legislation that prohibits members of City Council from owning any business that does business with the city or intends to do business with the city. I believe that Council members who are employed on a part-time basis should never be involved in obtaining city business for that Council member's employer.
At-large	Bill Green (D)	Public officials should not hire or recommend to the City any business in which he or she has a financial stake as an employee or owner. The ethics board should require full disclosure.

There is no ethics law that deals with a public official negotiating for future employment with a private company that does business with the City, according to the Board of Ethics.

7. I will support legislation that places reasonable and well-articulated regulations on public officials who seek future outside employment while still on the City's payroll.

District 4	Curtis Jones, Jr. (D)	I would support limits on the legal right of city employees to negotiate for future employment with a company doing
------------	-----------------------	---



		business with the city provided that the employee was in a position to influence the relationship between the city and the company in question.
--	--	---

The timing of a special election to fill a vacancy on City Council is left to the discretion of the President of City Council. This leaves open the possibility of one or more vacancies remaining unfilled for long periods of time, thereby undermining the effectiveness of the legislative process and leaving constituents unrepresented.

8. I will support amending the Philadelphia Home Rule Charter to provide clear and and non-discretionary rules for scheduling a special election to fill a vacancy on City Council.

District 4	Curtis Jones, Jr. (D)	I agree. I am from the Fourth Councilmanic district and know first hand the trauma that is caused and very real price that constituents pay when Council fails to act in a timely fashion, placing the voters need for representation above, political interests of Council.
At-large	William Greenlee (D)	The timing of a special election to fill a vacancy on City Council is left to the discretion of the President of City Council. This leaves open the possibility of one or more vacancies remaining unfilled for long periods of time, thereby undermining the effectiveness of the legislative process and leaving constituents unrepresented. In addition, there needs to be a more open process for filling vacancies on the City Council.

Many people complain that Council meetings are inhospitable to citizens, characterized by members talking on cell phones, walking in and out of the room and, on occasion, marked by displays of unruly behavior and open hostility among members.

9. I will nurture a culture that treats all individuals coming before Council with dignity and respect and that demands civility among all members of Council and their staffs.

District 4	Curtis Jones, Jr. (D)	I agree. Councilmembers are PUBLIC SERVANTS and as such, are employees of the voters. Council should strive to maintain
------------	-----------------------	---



		dignity and decorum that the honor of public office represents. Even in the height of debate and heartfelt disagreements, Council must resolve to settle disputes and conflicts with open dialogue and a civil democratic process.
At-large	William Greenlee (D)	Our entire City government needs to adopt a better customer service attitude. This shift must start with the next Mayor and City Council. Too many people complain that Council meetings are inhospitable to citizens, characterized by members talking on cell phones, walking in and out of the room and, on occasion, marked by displays of unruly behavior and open hostility among members.

The City Charter requirement that all City Council meetings be open and accessible to the public at all times has often been sidestepped, with important changes effectively happening behind closed doors or meetings scheduled at times when most members of the public are unable to attend.

10. I will promote greater public access to, and participation in, meetings and hearings convened by City Council and its committees -- including holding more sessions during evening hours and in locations throughout the City and also providing timely and complete transcripts on City Council's web site.

District 4	Curtis Jones, Jr. (D)	I agree. An educated and well-informed voter is the best deterrent to unethical conduct.
District 7	Maria Quiñones Sánchez (D)	I will also urge the translation of information whenever possible.
At-large	William Greenlee (D)	The City Charter requirement that all City Council meetings be open and accessible to the public at all times has often been sidestepped, with important changes effectively happening behind closed doors or meetings scheduled at times when most members of the public are unable to attend.

11. I will support reforms that make the business of City Council, including rules, more understandable to the average citizen.

District 4	Curtis Jones, Jr. (D)	I agree. Such reforms are critical for both maintaining the public trust and encouraging the public's full engagement.
------------	-----------------------	--



Frequently, political friends and financial supporters are appointed to, or hired or confirmed for, positions in offices, departments, boards, commissions, agencies and authorities in city government -- creating doubts about their qualifications and their independence.

12. I will frequently publish the names of all donors to my campaign account, political committees and non-governmental organizations I control, above and beyond what is required by state law.

District 4	Curtis Jones, Jr. (D)	I support the fiscal transparency currently embodied in the City's campaign finance laws. I also recognize that private citizens have a right to privacy. However, I'd prefer that this is matter that would be made moot by instituting the public financing of political campaigns.
District 10	Brian O'Neill (R)	I support legislation that would establish more frequent reporting than is now required by state law.

13. I will only hire, promote, appoint and confirm individuals who meet the highest standards for ethics, integrity and character, as well as published, objective qualifications to perform the jobs to which they are assigned, without regard to past or future political support.

District 4	Curtis Jones, Jr. (D)	I agree. I support setting a higher standard for public employees.
At-large	William Greenlee (D)	Once again we should be a meritocracy.

14. I will assume personal responsibility for interviewing and hiring all individuals who work directly or indirectly for me, and will further require that all such individuals report either to me or to others on my staff as designated by me.



District 4	Curtis Jones, Jr. (D)	I agree. Oversight of city employees and administration officials and accountability to the public is one of the most important roles of the City Council.
---------------	-----------------------	--

The new independent Board of Ethics received a strong mandate from the citizens of Philadelphia to regulate the ethical conduct of city government.

15. I will require all employees who work for me, and all appointees for whom I am responsible, paid and unpaid, to abide by all Board of Ethics advisory opinions, rules and enforcement decisions and will cooperate fully with the Board in carrying out its investigative responsibilities and implementing its rules and decisions.

District 4	Curtis Jones, Jr. (D)	I agree. I will comply and assist the Board of Ethics.
---------------	-----------------------	--

16. I will work with my colleagues on City Council to ensure ample funding to support the operations of the Board of Ethics including, but not limited to, the appointment of an independent General Counsel who is unaffiliated with the mayor or City Council.

District 4	Curtis Jones, Jr. (D)	I will support the Board of Ethics. I will reserve the right to review any expansion of the Board or its jurisdiction and roll on case by case basis.
At-large	Bill Green (D)	The new independent Board of Ethics received a strong mandate from the citizens of Philadelphia to regulate the ethical conduct of city government.

An executive order places strict limitations on the solicitation or acceptance of gifts, gratuities and favors by officials in the executive and administrative branches of government.

17. I will seek the enactment of permanent legislation that bans the acceptance of gifts, gratuities and favors above a nominal amount by members of City Council and their staffs.



Some cities have dropped some of the perks that go along with public office, such as giving public officials complimentary tickets to events in City-owned or City-managed facilities, particularly when budget cuts threaten other city services.

18. I will seek reasonable limitations on the number of complimentary tickets given to public officials for use at any City-owned or City-managed facility, which includes a prohibition on using those tickets for any past, current or future political fundraising purposes.

The City Charter forbids City Council members from engaging in political activity that takes place during scheduled hours of City employment. The lines between doing Council work and campaign work are often blurred.

19. I will abide by all laws regulating political activities – both permissible and prohibited – that might benefit me or any other candidate for political office, and will demand the same of members of my personal staff and any other staff who report to me.

At-large	William Greenlee (D)	While the City Charter <i>already</i> forbids City Council members from engaging in political activity that takes place during scheduled hours of City employment, the lines between doing Council work and campaign work are too often blurred.
----------	----------------------	--

Lobbyists or lawyers acting as lobbyists are often perceived as having improper or undue influence on decisions made by the Office of the Mayor, City Council and other City departments, agencies and commissions.

20. I will seek the enactment of an ordinance requiring all lobbyists, and individuals acting as lobbyists, engaged in business with the City, City-related departments, agencies and commissions and quasi-City agencies and authorities, to register as lobbyists, identify their clients and make public their expenses.

District 4	Curtis Jones, Jr. (D)	I agree. This recommendation is similar to what lobbyists are required to do for the Commonwealth of PA, in the name of
------------	-----------------------	---



		full disclosure. Philadelphia needs to do this now to instill a sense that we are serious about accountability.
At-large	William Greenlee (D)	Lobbyists or lawyers acting as lobbyists are often perceived as having improper or undue influence on decisions made by the Office of the Mayor, City Council and other City departments, agencies and commissions. Again, the people of Philadelphia deserve to know who is trying to influence public policy and who they are doing it for.

A recent study found that Philadelphia has two City Council districts whose political lines are among the most unevenly drawn in the nation. Redistricting will occur during the next mayor's term in office.

21. I will call upon the next mayor to convene a non-partisan and independent citizen's commission to allow for an open and public process that will result in a fair redistricting plan, thereby reducing the conflicts of interest inherent when political district lines are drawn exclusively by the mayor and City Council. The commission will report to the mayor and to City Council.

District 4	Curtis Jones, Jr. (D)	I agree. There is a need to de-politicize the redistricting process. Once the mayor and city council agree on the priorities (i.e. population, size, etc) that should inform the process, it is reasonable to convene some form of non-partisan commission to implement the policy developed by the city's elected leaders.
At-large	Bill Green (D)	A recent study found that Philadelphia has two City Council districts whose political lines are among the most unevenly drawn in the nation. A fair redistricting should occur during the next City Council term in office.

Pennsylvania has a poor reputation when it comes to disclosure of public documents.

22. I will seek the adoption of, and support compliance with, new rules making all City and City Council documents public, consistent with the best practices in the nation, unless there is a compelling reason to restrict access to those documents.

At-large	William Greenlee (D)	Again, we need more transparency in our city government. Philadelphia has a poor reputation when it comes to disclosure of public documents. In addition, we should make these
----------	----------------------	--



		documents available on line at www.phila.gov .
--	--	---
